

The Department of Ecology's Response to: Dan Smith – City of Federal Way (Comment 54)

Listing ID 15830

Upon review of this listing, it was determined that an error had been made when assigning the initial category (Category 5) for this listing. The basis statement stated the criteria was met. As a result, Ecology changed this listing from a Category 5 to a Category 1 listing. The listing was not changed from Category 5 to Category 1 based on the age of available data. Ecology does not remove listings due to age of data unless there is new data that supplants the older data, and the new data contradicts the old data. To downgrade a listing simply because the data is old would provide an incentive for entities to stop monitoring, in hopes that a listing will just vanish due to age.

The commenter wishes to compare this listing to three other listings where the basis statement stated the criteria was not met. A later review was done on waters that were recently changed from other categories to Category 1. The purpose was to determine if enough data existed to determine if Category 1 was actually the correct category as defined in the Water Quality Assessment Listing Policy. Listing ID 15830 did not have enough information to make a clear determination of Category 1 and was subsequently moved to Category 3 (Insufficient information). This listing is not comparable to Listing IDs 15835, 13965, or 15887.

Listing ID 12572

This was a new listing for the 2004 Assessment. It was determined to be a Category 1 based on the data from 2002. The category for this listing has never changed. There has been no demonstration that criteria were exceeded. This listing is not comparable to Listing IDs 15835, 13965, and 15887 which have bases that demonstrate that criteria were exceeded. Listing ID 12572 has not been removed. It remains in Category 1.

Listing ID 12577

This was a new listing for the 2004 Assessment. It was determined to be a Category 1 based on the data from 2002. The category for this listing has never changed. There has been no demonstration that criteria were exceeded. This listing is not comparable to Listing IDs 15835, 13965, and 15887 which have bases that demonstrate that criteria were exceeded. Listing ID 12577 has not been removed. It remains in Category 1.

Listing ID 15831

This listing was compared to Listing ID 15830. A review of the basis statements shows that the criteria was not met in listing ID 15831, while in Listing 15830, the basis statement shows the criteria was met. The listing error made on Listing ID 15830 which was corrected to Category 1, and subsequently re-corrected to Category 3, is not related Listing ID 15831 which remains Category 5.

Listing ID 13965

This listing was compared to Listing ID 15830. A review of the basis statements shows that the criteria was not met in listing ID 13965, while in Listing 15830, the basis statement shows the

criteria was met. The listing error made on Listing ID 15830 which was corrected to Category 1, and subsequently re-corrected to Category 3, is not related Listing ID 13965 which remains Category 5.

Listing ID 15887

This listing was compared to Listing ID 15830. A review of the basis statements shows that the criteria was not met in listing ID 15887, while in Listing 15830, the basis statement shows the criteria was met. The listing error made on Listing ID 15830 which was corrected to Category 1, and subsequently re-corrected to Category 3, is not related Listing ID 13965 which remains Category 5.