

Fish Consumption Technical Review Meeting

Discussion Questions

The Department of Ecology (Ecology) has requested public review of a series of technical support documents designed to respond to issues raised during the public comment period for Version 1 of the Fish Consumption Rate Technical Support Document (TSD). These documents are posted on Ecology's web portal on reducing toxics in fish (<http://ecy.wa.gov/toxics/fish.html>).

1. The revised TSD presents national and regional fish consumption data, and provides relevant supporting information designed to respond to issues raised during the public comment period.
 - a. Does the revised TSD provide a credible and balanced evaluation of the current information on fish consumption rates in the Pacific NW?
 - b. Is the revised TSD consistent with the weight of scientific evidence on fish consumption rates in the Pacific NW?
 - c. If not, what additional information and/or evaluations should be included?
2. Ecology contracted with the University of Washington to analyze the national fish consumption data to address public comments about methodological limitations of the national data. The analysis included application of the National Cancer Institute (NCI) methodology to data from the 2003 to 2006 National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey (NHANES), to address issues associated with estimation of long-term fish consumption rates using short-term data for episodically consumed foods.
 - a. Do the statistical analyses conducted reflect sound biostatistical principles and methods?
 - b. Do the statistical analyses provide technically defensible estimates of national fish consumption rates?
 - c. If not, what methods would you recommend be used to evaluate the national fish consumption data?
3. Regional fish consumption surveys were assessed based on applicability of the survey to WA fish consumers and the technical defensibility of the survey design and implementation. The revised TSD also presents available recreational fish consumption data, and includes results of additional statistical analysis of each of the regional fish consumption surveys to distinguish local vs. non-local harvest and species groups consumed. With tribal permission and where data were available, individual dietary response information was evaluated.
 - a. Does the revised TSD provide a credible and balanced discussion of fish consumption survey designs and interpretation methods?

- b. Does the information presented in the TSD include all relevant available fish dietary information for the Pacific NW?
 - c. Is the statistical analysis used to estimate regional fish consumption rates technically defensible?
 - d. Does the revised TSD (and associated supporting documentation) provide a technically accurate and balanced picture of fish consumption for fish-consuming populations in the Pacific NW?
 - e. If not, what revisions do you believe should be made to the TSD? Is there additional information that Ecology should consider that would improve the technical credibility and defensibility of the regional-specific fish consumption estimates?
4. The revised TSD distinguishes between scientific and policy issues associated with using the available scientific information to support regulatory decisions.
- a. Does the revised TSD provide a clear distinction between matters of science and policy?
 - b. If not, what revisions would help clarify this distinction?
5. What additional evaluations and/or research would you recommend to address issues and concerns associated with questions 1 through 4?
6. What are your primary scientific concerns surrounding Ecology's use of the information in the revised TSD to support MTCA cleanup decisions?