
Governor's Blue Ribbon Panel on Ocean Acidification

Summary of Seventh Meeting

Friday, October 12, 2012, 9:00 a.m. – 4:00 p.m.

NOAA Pacific Marine Environmental Laboratory, Building 3, Seattle, WA

Meeting agenda and other documents are available on the WA Dept. Ecology Ocean Acidification Panel webpage: <http://www.ecy.wa.gov/water/marine/oa/panel.html>

Meeting Attendance and Objectives

The Blue Ribbon Panel on Ocean Acidification held its seventh meeting on October 12th, 2012, in Building 3 of the NOAA Pacific Marine Environmental Laboratory in Seattle, WA. The meeting was open to the public and broadcast as a webinar.

Panel members, staff and invited guests participating in this meeting included Hedia Adelman, Simone Alin (PMEL alternate for Richard Feely), Lisa Ayers, Lara Whitely Binder, Brian Blake, Steve Bloomfield, Chad Bowe chop (Makah Tribal Council alternate for Micah McCarty), Shallin Busch, Meg Chadsey, Bill Dewey, Megan Duffy (alternate for Commissioner Peter Goldmark) Paul Dye (The Nature Conservancy alternate for Chris Davis), Richard Feely, Carolyn Friedman, Kate Kelly (EPA alternate for Dennis McLerran), Sara Kendall, Terrie Klinger, Jay Manning, Micah McCarty, Jan Newton, Betsy Peabody, Kevin Ranker, Bill Ruckelshaus, Jennifer Ruesink, Ted Sturdevant, George Waldbusser, Brad Warren, and Terry Williams.

Over 50 stakeholders and members of the public participated, in person and via webinar.

This purpose of this final Panel meeting was to update Panel members on the status of the recommendations and Final Report, and to provide an opportunity for discussion on any remaining issues related to the six action categories: reducing carbon dioxide emissions; reducing nutrient and organic carbon inputs; adaptation and remediation; research and monitoring; public education and outreach and post-Panel coordination.

Panel members were also briefed on the communications strategy and talking points, as well as plans for the release of the final report.

Presentations and Discussions

All presentations are available on the WA Dept. of Ecology Ocean Acidification webpage (<http://www.ecy.wa.gov/water/marine/oa/panel.html>) and should be consulted for details. This summary focuses on discussions generated by the presentations.

Welcome

Jay Manning and Bill Ruckelshaus, Panel Co-chairs

Jay and Bill thanked the Panel members and staff for their commitment to the process over the past seven months. They urged Panel members to voice any concerns about the report recommendations at this meeting, as there will be no further opportunities for substantive edits. By the end of the meeting, all members should feel comfortable endorsing the final product.

Report Overview

Lara Whitely Binder, Panel Facilitator

In reviewing the current set of recommended actions, Lara updated Panel members on substantive changes that have been made to the Final Report since the first draft (based on Panel member feedback). Report editors and workgroup leads have also made the following changes:

- Prioritized recommendations have been replaced by ‘Key Early Actions’ (KEAs).
- Text of Actions has been consolidated and shortened. Redundancies have been resolved, and there is better bridging between related Actions.
- The valuation of state shellfish and marine resources now includes wild harvest.
- Distinction between monitoring recommended in Chapter 6 (Research and Monitoring) vs. Chapter 7 (Adaptation and Remediation) has been more clearly delineated.

General suggestions for restructuring the Report included separating scientific information from policy recommendations in the introductory chapters, moving ‘implementation leads’ and other action-specific information out of the body of the report into a table, and possibly identifying a ‘Top 5’ recommendations from the list of KEAs. Major edits and Panel members’ issues related to specific action areas would be covered during discussion of relevant action categories.

Panel members asked for clarification of ‘Key Early Action’; after discussion, a KEA was defined as “an action the Panel considers to be essential next steps for reducing the risks associated with acidification, independent of assumptions about the availability of funding or political feasibility.”

Related presentation slides:

http://www.ecy.wa.gov/water/marine/oa/20121012_overview.pdf

Comments and Discussion of the Final Report

This session provided an opportunity for Panel members to review and discuss any remaining issues with the Final Report. The morning session focused on recommendations in the first three action categories: reducing carbon dioxide emissions, reducing nutrient and organic carbon inputs, and adaptation and remediation. The afternoon session focused on the remaining action categories: research and monitoring, public education and outreach, and post-Panel coordination.

Chapter 4: Reducing Carbon Dioxide Emissions

The Actions in this chapter are aimed at reducing global, national, and local emissions of carbon dioxide (Strategy 4.1). Discussion points included the appropriate scope of these actions (regional vs. national/international), and the necessary basis for implementing regulatory measures to control acidifying gases in Action 4.1.3. Panel members agreed to edits affecting Actions 4.1.1, 4.1.2 and 4.1.3.

Related presentation slides:

http://www.ecy.wa.gov/water/marine/oa/20121012_co2emissions.pdf

Chapter 5: Reducing Nutrient and Organic Carbon Inputs

These Actions have been significantly reorganized since the first draft, to reflect the Panel's desire to separate recommendations that are justified by current scientific information from those that should only be implemented if merited by new scientific information. The first set of Actions is aimed at strengthening and augmenting existing pollutant controls to reduce nutrients and organic carbon in marine waters (Strategy 5.1). The second set proposes implementing new pollution controls to reduce and limit nutrients and organic carbon in areas where they are found to be contributing significantly to acidification in marine waters (Strategy 5.2). Panel members agreed to edits affecting Strategy 5.1 and Actions 5.1.2, 5.1.3, 5.1.4, 5.2.2 and 5.2.3.

Related presentation slides:

http://www.ecy.wa.gov/water/marine/oa/20121012_nutrientreduction.pdf

Chapter 6: Adaptation and Remediation

Panel members proposed adding two new Actions to this chapter. The first, to preserve and restore native seagrass and algae habitat, would insure that the phytoremediation strategies proposed in Action 6.1.1 that involve removal of marine vegetation in selected areas would not be misapplied. The second, to establish a mechanism for evaluating emerging adaptation and remediation technologies, would fill a current gap in federal research programs; discussion centered on the appropriate category for such an action (Adaptation and Remediation, or post-Panel?), and a responsible entity. Panel scientists and shellfish industry representatives debated whether monitoring recommendations in Chapter 6 should be consolidated into Chapter 7 (Research & Monitoring), but agreed that hatchery-based monitoring platforms serve a distinct adaptation purpose, and should be proposed separately. Panel members agreed to edits affecting Strategy 6.2 and Actions 6.1.1, 6.2.1, 6.2.3, 6.2.4 and 6.3.3. In addition they agreed to

Related presentation slides:

http://www.ecy.wa.gov/water/marine/oa/20121012_adaptation.pdf

Chapter 7: Research and Monitoring

Recent comments from the Makah Tribe were not submitted in time to be included in the

meeting materials, but Panel scientists have reviewed and approved them. The Panel scientists endorsed the idea of a Science Coordination Team to oversee regional research and monitoring efforts. Panel members agreed to adopt a revised version of Action 7.1.1, consolidated the five Actions under Strategy 3 into three (7.3.1 and 7.3.3 are still identified as KEAs), and move Action 7.4.4 to the post-Panel category.

Related presentation slides:

http://www.ecy.wa.gov/water/marine/oa/20121012_researchmonitoring.pdf

Chapter 8: Public Education and Outreach

Panel members discussed whether this action category should be limited to education, or be broadened to include “engagement” that would “lead to action”. Recognizing that engagement is intrinsic to post-Panel recommendations, Panel members decided this action category should focus on education. If the Panel effectively communicates their consensus opinion that ocean acidification is an urgent problem that needs to be addressed, the public and decision makers will be moved to take action. Panel members agreed to edits affecting the Chapter Title, Strategy 8.1 and Action 8.2.2.

Related presentation slides:

http://www.ecy.wa.gov/water/marine/oa/20121012_publiceducation.pdf

Chapter 9: Post-Panel Coordination

Panel co-chairs stressed the need to keep the language of these recommendations general, so the Governor can enact as she sees fit. Panel members were supportive of a cabinet-level authority (a person or an entity) to oversee post-Panel activities, but stressed that this post should coordinate with the tribes, and the private and non-profit sectors. It was agreed that the proposed Science Coordination Team (previously assigned to Research and Monitoring) should be moved to this action category, and that this Team be responsible for evaluating emerging adaptation and mitigation technologies. Panel members agreed to edits affecting Action 9.1.1.

Related presentation slides:

http://www.ecy.wa.gov/water/marine/oa/20121012_postpanel.pdf

Communications Strategy and Plans for Release of the Final Report

Hedia Adelsman, Washington Dept. of Ecology

On Oct. 22, Bill Ruckelshaus will meet with representatives from the agricultural sector; Panel members Norma Smith, Bill Dewey and Brian Blake were invited to join this meeting. Panel scientists participated in a communications training session organized by COMPASS (<http://www.compassonline.org/>), and found it very valuable. This session will be offered to Panel members as a one-hour webinar on Oct 29th and the week of Nov. 6th. The Communications Team is making a special effort to reach the media, and Panel members may be

contacted for interviews.

The Congressional delegation and agency leads will be invited to the Nov 27th Report Launch at the Seattle Aquarium; Panel members should suggest other guests to Hedia. Hard copies of Report will be distributed to all Panel members at this event; copies of the executive summary will be available for the public and media.

Next Steps

Lara Whitely Binder, Panel Facilitator

Substantive comments on the current draft Report must be submitted by Oct. 17th; the final draft will be distributed to Panel members on Oct. 19th. Only minor comments will be accepted after this date; these are due Oct. 31.